# Award FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution

In the Matter of the Arbitration Between:

Claimants Case Number: 13-03520

Luis R. Romero Lopez, Individually and on Behalf of his Pledged Collateral Account and Special Account

VS.

Respondents <u>Hearing Site</u>: San Juan, Puerto Rico

**UBS Financial Services Inc.** 

UBS Financial Services Incorporated of Puerto Rico

Natura of the Dispute: Customore vs. Members

Nature of the Dispute: Customers vs. Members

This case was decided by an all-public panel.

#### REPRESENTATION OF PARTIES

For Claimants Luis R. Romero Lopez, Individually ("Romero") and on Behalf of his Pledged Collateral Account and Special Account: Samuel B. Edwards, Esq., Kirk G. Smith, Esq. and Luis J. Acevedo-Bengoechea, Esq., Shepherd, Smith, Edwards & Kantas, LLP, Houston, Texas.

For Respondent UBS Financial Services Inc. ("UBS"): A. Inge Selden, Esq., Gregg McCormick, Esq. and Donald F. Winningham, Esq., Bressler, Amery & Ross, P.C., Birmingham, Alabama.

For Respondent UBS Financial Services Incorporated of Puerto Rico ("UBSPR"): Roberto C. Quinones-Rivera, Esq., McConnell Valdes LLC, Hato Rey, Puerto Rico.

#### CASE INFORMATION

Statement of Claim filed on or about: November 29, 2013.

Luis R. Romero Lopez, Individually and on Behalf of his Pledged Collateral Account and Special Account, signed the Submission Agreement: November 23, 2013.

Statement of Answer filed by Respondents and Counterstatement of Claim filed by Respondent UBSPR on or about: February 26, 2014.

UBS Financial Services Inc. signed the Submission Agreement: December 16, 2013. UBS Financial Services Incorporated of Puerto Rico signed the Submission Agreement: April 9, 2014.

Statement of Answer to Respondent UBSPR's Counterclaim filed by Claimants on or about: April 1, 2014.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 13-03520 Award Page 2 of 7

Motion in Limine to Exclude Regulatory Settlements filed by Respondents on or about: September 21, 2016.

Response to Motion in Limine filed by Claimants on or about: September 30, 2016.

#### **CASE SUMMARY**

Claimants asserted the following causes of action: breach of contract, warranties, and promissory estoppel; violations of securities statutes; violations of fault/negligence statutes; violations of fiduciary/officious manager statutes; violations of fraud, misrepresentation and omission statutes; and claims under common law. The causes of action relate to Claimants' investments in Puerto Rican municipal bonds and closedend bond funds.

Unless specifically admitted in the Statement of Answer and Counterstatement of Claim, Respondents denied the allegations made in the Statement of Claim and asserted various affirmative defenses. In its Counterstatement of Claim, Respondent UBSPR asserted the following causes of action: breach of contract; unjust enrichment; and account stated. The causes of action relate to Claimants' alleged failure to repay sums due Respondent UBSPR pursuant to a Credit Line Agreement.

Unless specifically admitted in the Answer to Respondent UBSPR's Counterclaim, Claimants denied the allegations made in the Statement of Answer and Counterstatement of Claim and asserted various affirmative defenses.

#### **RELIEF REQUESTED**

In the Statement of Claim, Claimants requested: compensatory damages in an amount exceeding \$10,000,000.00; direct and consequential damages; all sums lost in the accounts on any or all transactions made or not made; all lost opportunities incurred; rescission; statutory damages; punitive damages; pre-award and pre-judgment interest on all sums invested from the date deposited until the date of the award and until such sums are paid, at the highest rate allowed by law; costs; attorneys' fees; and any and all other relief, in law or equity, which may be granted by the Panel.

In the Statement of Answer and Counterstatement of Claim, Respondents requested: that Claimants take nothing by their claims and the Panel dismiss Claimants' claims in their entirety, with prejudice; expungement of this arbitration from the Central Registration Depository ("CRD") records of the affected individual Respondents; assessment of all FINRA fees and costs against Claimants; and such other and further relief as deemed just and equitable by the Panel. Additionally, Respondent UBSPR requested damages in excess of \$2,900,000.00 for breach of the Credit Line Agreement.

In the Answer to Respondent UBSPR's Counterclaim, Claimants requested that the Panel render an award in favor of Claimants and find that Respondent UBSPR take nothing from their Counterclaim, that Respondent UBSPR pay all costs associated with its Counterclaim and that the Panel award Claimants all additional relief deemed just under the circumstances.

#### OTHER ISSUES CONSIDERED AND DECIDED

The Arbitrators acknowledge that they have each read the pleadings and other materials filed by the parties.

In their Motion in Limine to Exclude Regulatory Settlements, Respondents asserted that, among other things, the settlements brought by governmental regulatory authorities are not admissions of the underlying allegations and charges and cannot be considered as evidence in other proceedings and entry of the regulatory settlements into evidence would be unfairly prejudicial. In their Response, Claimants asserted, among other things that the evidence is admissible and is not unfairly prejudicial to Respondents. After hearing oral argument from the parties at the outset of the evidentiary hearing, the Panel denied the Motion and admitted the regulatory settlements for whatever weight the Panel determined they deserve.

The parties agreed that the Award in this matter may be executed in counterpart copies or that a handwritten, signed Award may be entered.

#### **AWARD**

After considering the pleadings, the testimony and evidence presented at the hearing, and the post-hearing submissions (if any), the Panel has decided in full and final resolution of the issues submitted for determination as follows:

- 1. Respondents UBS and UBSPR are jointly and severally liable for and shall pay to Claimants the sum of \$9,000,000.00 in compensatory damages.
- 2. Claimants are jointly and severally liable for and shall pay to Respondent UBSPR the sum of \$1,016,770.00 in compensatory damages.
- 3. The compensatory damage amounts stated above are offset. Therefore, Respondents UBS and UBSPR are jointly and severally liable for and shall pay to Claimants compensatory damages in the amount of \$7,983,230.00, plus interest at the rate of 6% per annum accruing from 10 days following the date of service of this Award through the date of satisfaction of this Award.
- 4. Respondent UBS is liable for and shall pay to Claimants the sum of \$1,000,000.00 in punitive damages plus interest thereon at the rate of 6% per annum accruing from 10 days following the date of service of this Award through the date of satisfaction of this Award. Punitive damages are awarded for Respondent UBS' intentional and willful provision of a "non-purpose" loan which was either knowingly encouraged to be "recycled" to buy more securities in violation of Regulation U or provided with a reckless indifference to the consequences of the loan recycling which caused additional excessive leverage so that when there was a downturn in the market, Claimants lost more money than they would have had they been suitably invested with less leverage. Respondent UBS's exercised extreme recklessness and indifference to the consequences of loan recycling by failing to utilize a supervisory system which would have alerted upper management that Claimant Romero had taken \$8,000,000.00 from his non-purpose loan account on one day and re-

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 13-03520 Award Page 4 of 7

deposited the exact same amount less than two weeks later to buy securities. Moreover Respondent UBS managers in New York were informed and denied that loans were being recycled in Puerto Rico and used to buy securities. The closed end funds which comprised a majority of Claimants' investments with Respondent UBS, were not marginable and thus Respondent UBS benefited from the loan recycling.

An arbitration panel has the authority to award punitive damages pursuant to <u>Mastrobuono v. Shearson Lehman Hutton, Inc.</u>, 514 U.S. 52 (1995). Additionally, pursuant to <u>Exxon Shipping Company v. Baker</u>, 554 U.S. 471, 493-494 (2008):

The prevailing rule in American courts also limits punitive damages to cases of what the Court in Day, supra, at 371, spoke of as "enormity," where a defendant's conduct is "outrageous," 4 Restatement § 908(2), owing to "gross negligence," "willful, wanton, and reckless indifference for the rights of others," or behavior even more deplorable, 1 Schlueter § 9.3(A).

- 5. Claimants' request for attorneys' fees is denied.
- 6. Other than forum fees which are specified below, the parties shall each bear their own costs and expenses incurred in this matter.
- 7. The Panel determined that since Respondents UBS and UBSPR did not pursue their request for expungement of affected individual Respondents, the Panel deemed the expungement request to be withdrawn.
- 8. Any and all relief not specifically addressed herein is denied.
- 9. Any explanation of the Panel's decision in this Award is for the information of the parties only and is not precedential in nature.

#### **FEES**

Pursuant to the Code of Arbitration Procedure, the following fees are assessed:

#### Filing Fees

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution assessed a filing fee\* for each claim:

=\$ 1,800.00

Initial Claim Filing Fee Counterclaim Filing Fee

=\$ 3,200.00

#### Member Fees

Member fees are assessed to each member firm that is a party in these proceedings or to the member firm(s) that employed the associated person(s) at the time of the event(s) giving rise to the dispute. Accordingly, as parties, Respondents UBS and UBSPR are assessed the following:

<sup>\*</sup>The filing fee is made up of a non-refundable and a refundable portion.

UBS Member Surcharge	=\$ 3,750.00
Pre-Hearing Processing Fee	=\$ 750.00
Hearing Processing Fee	=\$ 5,500.00
UBSPR	
Member Surcharge	=\$ 3,750.00
Pre-Hearing Processing Fee	=\$ 750.00
Hearing Processing Fee	=\$ 5.500.00

### **Adjournment Fees**

Adjournments granted during these proceedings for which fees were assessed:

October 26-October 30, 2015,	adjournment by the parties	
------------------------------	----------------------------	--

Total Adjournment Fees	WAIVED

## **Hearing Session Fees and Assessments**

The Panel has assessed hearing session fees for each session conducted. A session is any meeting between the parties and the arbitrator(s), including a pre-hearing conference with the arbitrator(s) that lasts four (4) hours or less. Fees associated with these proceedings are:

Two (2) pre-hearing sessions with a single arbitrator @ \$450.00/session =\$ 900.00 Pre-hearing conferences: March 25, 2015 1 session			
Tro floating definerences.	July 28, 2015	1 session	
Two (2) pre-hearing sessions with the Panel @ \$1,200.00/session			=\$ 2,400.00
Pre-hearing conferences:	•	1 session	
	November 24, 2015	1 session	
Twenty-Four (24) hearing sessions @ \$1,200.00/session =\$28,800.00			=\$28,800.00
Hearing Dates:	October 11, 2016	2 sessions	,,
_	October 12, 2016	2 sessions	
	October 13, 2016	2 sessions	
	October 14, 2016	1 session	
	October 17, 2016	2 sessions	
	October 18, 2016	2 sessions	
	October 19, 2016	2 sessions	
	October 20, 2016	2 sessions	
	October 21, 2016	1 session	
	January 15, 2017	2 sessions	
	January 16, 2017	2 sessions	
	January 17, 2017	2 sessions	
	January 18, 2017	2 sessions	

WAIVED

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 13-03520 Award Page 6 of 7

The Panel has assessed \$15,825.00 of the hearing session fees jointly and severally to Claimants.

The Panel has assessed \$16,275.00 of the hearing session fees jointly and severally to Respondents, which includes the entire fee for the hearing session conducted on July 28, 2015.

All balances are payable to FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution and are due upon receipt.

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 13-03520 Award Page 7 of 7

## **ARBITRATION PANEL**

Joyce F. Glucksman Reinaldo Royo, Jr.

Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson

Robert J. Buchner

**Public Arbitrator** Public Arbitrator

I, the undersigned Arbitrator, do hereby affirm that I am the individual described herein and who executed this instrument which is my award.

## **Concurring Arbitrators' Signatures**

Joyce F. Glucksman	2/16/17
ပါတဲ့ce F. ဖြပ်cksman Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson	Signáture Date
Reinaldo Royo, Jr. Public Arbitrator	Signature Date
Robert J. Buchner Public Arbitrator	Signature Date

Date of Service (For FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution office use only)

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 13-03520 Award Page 7 of 7

## **ARBITRATION PANEL**

Joyce F. Glucksman Reinaldo Royo, Jr. Robert J. Buchner	- -	Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson Public Arbitrator Public Arbitrator
I, the undersigned Arbitrator, do hereby affirm that I am the individual described herein and who executed this instrument which is my award.		
Concurring Arbitrators' Signatures		
Joyce F. Glucksman Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson		Signature Date
Reinaldo Royo, Jr. Public Arbitrator		FEB. 17, 2017 Signature Date
Robert J. Buchner Public Arbitrator	NAARANINA PARINCINA SII SAASIA SI	Signature Date

 $\frac{2/17/17}{\text{Date of Service (For FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution office use only)}}$ 

FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 13-03520 Award Page 7 of 7

## ARBITRATION PANEL

Joyce F. Glucksman Reinaldo Royo, Jr. Robert J. Buchner Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson

Public Arbitrator

Public Arbitrator

I, the undersigned Arbitrator, do hereby affirm that I am the individual described herein and who executed this instrument which is my award.

## Concurring Arbitrators' Signatures

Joyce F. Glucksman Public Arbitrator, Presiding Chairperson Signature Date

Reinaldo Royo, Jr. Public Arbitrator Signature Date

Robert J. Buchner Public Arbitrator Fus. 16, 2077 Signature Date

2/17/17

Date of Service (For FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution office use only)